## Mathematics DOK Levels

Level 1 (Recall) [1.1] includes the recall of information such as a fact, definition, term, or a simple procedure, as well as performing a simple algorithm or applying a formula. [1.2] That is, in mathematics, a one-step, well-defined, and straight algorithmic procedure should be included at this lowest level. [1.3] Other key words that signify Level 1 include "identify," "recall," "recognize," "use," and "measure." [1.4] Verbs such as "describe" and "explain" could be classified at different levels, depending on what is to be described and explained. [1.5] Level 1 requires students to demonstrate a rote response, [1.6] perform a well-known algorithm, [1.7] follow a set procedure (like a recipe), or [1.8] perform a clearly defined series of steps. Multiple answers are a possibility for both Levels 1 and 2 (see 3.5).

## Level 1 Example (Grade 8)

From any vertex of a 4-sided polygon, 1 diagonal can be drawn.
From any vertex of a 5 -sided polygon, 2 diagonals can be drawn. From any vertex of a 6 -sided polygon, 3 diagonals can be drawn. From any vertex of a 7 -sided polygon, 4 diagonals can be drawn.

How many diagonals can be drawn from any vertex of a 20-sided polygon?

Explanation. The first thing to note is that this is not really a geometry item. Rather, it simply requires students to notice an easy, routine pattern. DOK levels are difficult to assign for many pattern-recognition problems, because they depend on how routine the pattern is. This particular pattern is immediately recognizable and requires no processing, but a more complex pattern could make this item Level 2 or even Level 3.

Level 2 (Skill/Concept) [2.1] includes the engagement of some mental processing beyond an habitual response. [2.2] A Level 2 assessment item requires students to make some decisions as to how to approach the problem or activity, whereas [1.5] Level 1 requires students to demonstrate a rote response, [1.6] perform a well-known algorithm, [1.7] follow a set procedure (like a recipe), or [1.8] perform a clearly defined series of steps. [2.3] Keywords that generally distinguish a Level 2 item include "classify," "organize," "estimate," "make observations," "collect and display data," and "compare data." These actions imply more than one step. [2.4] For example, to compare data requires first identifying characteristics of objects or phenomena and then grouping or ordering the objects. [2.5] Some action verbs, such as "explain," "describe," or "interpret," could be classified at different levels depending on the object of the action. [2.6] For example, interpreting information from a simple graph, or reading information from the graph, also are at Level 2. [3.11] Interpreting information from a complex graph that requires some decisions on what features of the graph need to be considered and how information from the graph can be aggregated is at Level 3. [2.7] Level 2 activities are not limited only to number skills, but may involve [2.8] visualization skills and [2.9] probability skills. [2.10] Other Level 2 activities include noticing or describing nontrivial patterns, [2.11] explaining the purpose and use of experimental procedures; [2.12] carrying out experimental procedures; [2.13] making observations and collecting data; [2.14] classifying, organizing, and comparing data; and [2.15] organizing and displaying data in tables, graphs, and charts.

## Level 2 Example (Grade 8)

A triangle has 0 diagonals, a quadrilateral has 2 diagonals, a pentagon has 5 diagonals, and a hexagon has 9 diagonals. If the pattern continues, how many diagonals will an octagon have?

| Sides | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Diagonals | 0 | 2 | 5 | 9 |

A 11
B 14
C 18
D 20

Explanation: This item is included in order to contrast it with the previous one. Pattern recognition is required, but the non-routine nature of this pattern brings this up to a higher DOK level. Some analysis and generalization is required in order to understand and extend this pattern.

The definitions and examples of Webb’s DOK levels were created by Norman Webb and are used here with his permission.

Level 3 (Strategic Thinking) [3.1] requires reasoning, planning, using evidence, and a higher level of thinking than the previous two levels. [3.2] In most instances, requiring students to explain their thinking is at Level 3. [3.3] Activities that require students to make conjectures are also at this level. [3.4] The cognitive demands at Level 3 are complex and abstract. [3.5] The complexity does not result from the fact that there are multiple answers, a possibility for both Levels 1 and 2, but because the task requires more demanding reasoning. [3.6] An activity, however, that has more than one possible answer and requires students to justify the response they give would most likely be at Level 3.
[3.7] Other Level 3 activities include drawing conclusions from observations; [3.8] citing evidence and developing a logical argument for concepts; [3.9] explaining phenomena in terms of concepts; and [3.10] deciding which concepts to apply in order to solve a complex problem. [3.11] Interpreting information from a complex graph that requires some decisions on what features of the graph need to be considered and how information from the graph can be aggregated is at Level 3.

Level 3 Example (11 ${ }^{\text {th }}$ Grade)
$S=a / b+c / d$

If $0<a<b<c<d$ in the equation above, then the greatest increase in $S$ would result from adding 1 to the value of which variable?
(A) $a$
(B) $b$
(C) $c$
(D) $d$
(E) There is not enough information to know for certain.

Level 3. If a multiple-choice item is Level 3, often it is because the multiple choices do not constrain or guide the possible solutions. The choices here allow for all possible responses to this item, including the response that the problem cannot be solved. This gives such an item the character of an open-ended item, even though it is not one.

The definitions and examples of Webb’s DOK levels were created by Norman Webb and are used here with his permission.

Level 4 (Extended Thinking) [4.1] requires complex reasoning, planning, developing, and thinking, most likely over an extended period of time. [4.2] The extended time period is not a distinguishing factor if the required work is only repetitive and does not require applying significant conceptual understanding and higher-order thinking. [4.3] For example, if a student has to take the water temperature from a river each day for a month and then construct a graph, this would be classified as a Level 2. [4.4] However, if the student is to conduct a river study that requires taking into consideration a number of variables, this would be a Level 4. [4.5] At Level 4, the cognitive demands of the task should be high and the work should be very complex. [4.6] Students should be required to make several connections-relate ideas within the content area or among content areas-and have to select one approach among many alternatives on how the situation should be solved, in order to be at this highest level. [4.7] Level 4 activities include designing and conducting experiments and projects; [4.8] developing and proving conjectures, [4.9] making connections between a finding and related concepts and phenomena; [4.10] combining and synthesizing ideas into new concepts; and [4.11] critiquing experimental designs.

## Level 4 Example (Grade 4)

Sam, Tetsuo, and Kim each own some baseball cards that Ted is willing trade them for. Here is what they are worth:

| Sam's cards: |  | Tetsuo's cards: |  | Kim's cards: |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bret Boone | $\$ 0.80$ | Sammy <br> Sosa | $\$ 1.30$ | Randy <br> Johnson | $\$ 0.70$ |  |
| Andres <br> Galarraga | $\$ 0.40$ | Greg <br> Maddux | $\$ 1.00$ | Barry <br> Bonds | $\$ 2.20$ |  |
| Mark <br> McGwire | $\$ 1.50$ |  |  |  |  |  |

Ted will trade his Alex Rodriguez card for $\$ 6.75$ worth of cards. What is the best trade that Sam, Tetsuo, and Kim can make for Ted’s Alex Rodriguez card?

What trade could Sam, Tetsuo, and Kim offer Ted that would be the most fair between Sam, Tetsuo, and Kim? Explain your thinking and show all your work.

Explanation: This is a complex open-ended problem requiring students "to make several connections and apply one approach among many." It requires the students to plan and organize, and to weigh solutions based on different kinds of criteria.
Students should be allowed at least 20 minutes for this problem, which is an extended period of time for a test item.

## ii. Sample Mathematics Assessment Items

Now try coding some sample assessment items using the Mathematics DOK Levels. Sample items, for three different grade levels. After you are finished coding these, read our "Answers" on the pages following the examples.

The following four items are from Grade 4 mathematics assessments:

## 1)

The class went on a field trip. The students left school at 9:00 a.m. They returned to school at $1: 30$ p.m. How long were they gone?

A 8 hr 30 min
B 8 hr
C 4 hr 30 min
D 4 hr

## 2)

Bill lives on the side of the street with even-numbered addresses. Which addresses below would be found on Bill's side of the street?

A $1020,1022,1024$
B 2021, 2023, 2025
C $3168,3169,3170$
D $4167,4168,4170$

The definitions and examples of Webb’s DOK levels were created by Norman Webb and are used here with his permission.

## 3)

Think carefully about the following question. Write a complete answer. You may use drawings, words, and numbers to explain your answer. Be sure to show all of your work.

Laura wanted to enter the number 8375 into her calculator. By mistake, she entered the number 8275 . Without clearing the calculator, how could she correct her mistake?

Without clearing the calculator, how could she correct her mistake another way?
4)


Based on the map above, about how many miles is the shortest route from Oakdale to Fenton?
A) 100
B) 70
C) 40
D) 20

The definitions and examples of Webb’s DOK levels were created by Norman Webb and are used here with his permission.

The following three items are from $\underline{\text { Grade } 8}$ assessments:
5)

In which set are the numbers equivalent?
A $\frac{1}{3}, \frac{3}{27}, 33 \%$
B $0.090,90 \%, 0.90$
C $88 \%, \frac{88}{100}, \frac{22}{25}$
D $0.66 \%, \frac{2}{3}, 66.7 \%$
6)

The school newspaper conducted a survey about which ingredient was most preferred as a pizza topping. This graph appeared in the newspaper article.

## Favorite Pizza Toppings



What information would best help you determine the number of people surveyed who preferred sausage?

A number of people surveyed and type of survey used
B type of survey used and ages of people surveyed
C percent values shown on chart and number of people surveyed
D ages of people surveyed and percent values shown on chart

## 7)

Look at the drawing. The numbers alongside each column and row are the total of the values of the symbols within each column and row. What should replace the question mark?

A. 23
B. 25
C. 28
D. 30
E. 32

The following five items are from Grade 11 assessments:
8) Which of the following is NOT true for any value of $x$ ?

A $\quad x<x^{2}<x^{3}$
B $\quad x^{3}<x<x^{2}$
C $\quad x^{2}<x<x^{3}$
D $\quad x<x^{3}<x^{2}$
E $\quad \mathrm{x}^{3}<\mathrm{x}^{2}<\mathrm{x}$

The definitions and examples of Webb's DOK levels were created by Norman Webb and are used here with his permission.

## 9)

Players A and B are playing a game. On a table between them is a stack of $n$ pennies. First, Player A removes either one or two pennies from the stack. Then Player B removes either one or two pennies from the stack. They alternate in this way until no pennies remain. The loser is the player who removes the last penny from the stack.

If they start the game with 5 pennies in the stack, how many pennies should Player A take from the stack on her first turn? Why?

If the game starts with 7 pennies in the stack, would you rather be Player A or B?
Why?
For what values of $n$, if any, is it best to be player A?
For what values of $n$, if any, is it best to be player B?
Explain and justify your answers.

## 10)

Which pentacube is not congruent to the others?
A

B

C

D


The definitions and examples of Webb's DOK levels were created by Norman Webb and are used here with his permission.

## 11)

One plan for a state income tax requires those persons with income of $\$ 10,000$ or less to pay no tax and those persons with income greater than $\$ 10,000$ to pay a tax of 6 percent only on the part of their income that exceeds $\$ 10,000$.

A person's effective tax rate is defined as the percent of total income that is paid in tax.
Based on this definition, could any person's effective tax rate be 5 percent? Could it be 6 percent? Explain your answer. Include examples if necessary to justify your conclusions.

DOK Levels for the Mathematics Sample Assessment Items

## Grade 4 Items:

1) Level 2. The choices offered indicate that this item is intended to identify students who would simply subtract 9 minus 1 to get an 8 . More than one step is required here. The students must first recognize the difference between a.m. and p.m. and make some decisions about how to make this into a subtraction problem, then do the subtraction.
2) Level 1. Students only need to be able to recognize even numbers.
3) Level 3. "An activity that has more than one possible answer and requires students to justify the response they give would most likely be a Level 3." Since there are multiple possible approaches to this problem, the student must make strategic decisions about how to proceed, which is more cognitively complex than simply applying a set procedure or skill.
4) Level 1. This measurement item requires no analysis of the map itself, since the route in question is a straight line. If the line was not straight, then this item would require estimation and perhaps even calculation, making it Level 2 or 3.

## Grade 8 Items:

5) Level 2. There are a number of different concepts and procedures that can be used for this problem, rather than just one obvious, simple one. Students must not only be able to identify different representations of rational numbers (Level 1), but also to manipulate and compare these representations (Level 2). This means that numerous interdependent and non-trivial steps are involved here. However, this does not require any conjecturing, planning, abstracting, or explaining, so it is not Level 3.

This item demonstrates the importance of knowing whether calculators are allowed on the examinations or not. If a calculator were allowed on this examination, this would clearly be Level 1, instead of Level 2.
6) Level 2. This is an example of how a problem that is multiple choice can reduce its DOK level. If the multiple choices were removed here and the problem were left openended, it would be Level 3. But here the student need only weigh the options against one another, easily discarding "type of survey used" and "ages of people surveyed" as bogeys. So they can easily determine that C is immediately better than A or D, without even having to think analytically or creatively about why percent values shown or number of people surveyed would be important information to know.

The definitions and examples of Webb’s DOK levels were created by Norman Webb and are used here with his permission.
7) Level 3. This item can be approached through a number of viable strategies: pattern recognition, guess-and-check, algebra, etc. This freedom means that the student must make choices and assumptions. Furthermore, no matter what strategy she employs, she must keep track of a complex logical chain. The multiple choices provided do not make this task any less complex.

## Grade 11 Items:

8) Level 3. This is another example of an item that is at Level 3 without being openended. This item requires generalization, reasoning, and hypothesis testing, involving some creativity in choosing examples that test the hypotheses.
9) Level 4. This problem requires students to form game strategies, create data, notice number patterns, and justify how and why those patterns arise. It involves inductive, deductive, and strategic reasoning over an extended period of time, perhaps 30 minutes. This may even be a problem best done in pairs or groups within a testing environment.
10) Level 2. This item is not Level 1 because it is not routine, nor does it focus on a memorized definition or procedure. In fact, it involves numerous steps, because it requires students to compare several different pairs of shapes before arriving at the correct answer. For these reasons, many spatial reasoning items are Level 2.

Note that this may be a coded as a source-of-challenge item, because choice C seems to be drawn in a misleading way.
11) Level 3. This item gives the student a new definition and asks her to reason using it. In order to ascertain whether the student really understands the asymptotic behavior that makes a $6 \%$ effective rate impossible, this item must be open-ended. This is why most Level 3 items are open-response items, because the complexity of thinking they require the students to display could not be displayed using multiple choices.

The definitions and examples of Webb’s DOK levels were created by Norman Webb and are used here with his permission.

